



គណៈកម្មាធិការ
សហប្រតិបត្តិការដើម្បីកម្ពុជា
Cooperation Committee
for Cambodia
Comité de Coopération
Pour le Cambodge

ទស្សនវិស័យ: ការអភិវឌ្ឍប្រកបដោយនិរន្តរភាពសម្រាប់ប្រទេសកម្ពុជា
Vision: Sustainable development for Cambodia

Minutes of Bi Monthly Member Meeting

Meeting Date: 7 April 2016

Meeting Time: 7:30am to 12:00pm

Meeting Venue: KSSA/ICF

Recorded By: COMP III

Bi Monthly Member and Dissemination event on Financing Development

The 241st Bi-Monthly Members meeting of CCC will be convened on 7 April 2016. Based on CCC's Bylaw, the meeting is designed for country representatives/executive directors and/or senior leaders/managers of CCC members to attend and bring the common concerns on the development challenges and prioritized the issues to be addressed by relevant stakeholders. The meeting will be discussed on the following objectives:

1. To share information and update members about status of LANGO, mid-term review of National Strategic Development Plan (NSDP), localization process of Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs), engagement with G7 and G20, and CCC's internal milestones which are beneficial to CCC members.
2. To present preliminary result of quick survey on taxation in civil society, and discuss on its way forward
3. To launch a new initiative called "culturing good practice and sustainability of Community Based Organizations".
4. To generate feedback/inputs from members on zero draft on Global Reference Standards for CSO Accountability.

Key highlights of the meeting:

- Mr. Michael Roberts had said that CCC is very important for CSOs in Cambodia as the organization has led on the advocacy of the implications of LANGO, coordinating CSOs in SDGs, promoting good governance of NGO and support the D&D reform, as well as working on the finance for development.
- Mr. Meta, Executive director of CFT had mentioned that there are four main projects running by CFT currently, integrated community development, improving social justice, enhance community education, organizational and institutional development.
- Ms. Sin Puthary presented the interface of the Online NGOs database and the brief result of the member satisfaction survey.
- Mr. Soeung Saroeun, the critical survey of the taxation had resulted and extend discussion for the better way and need of member.
- Mr. Chhorn Vatanak had mentioned that, with joint proposal with ICSO and supported from DFAT, CCC had launched the new project of the CBO guideline.
- Mr. Sorn Savooun had presented the global standard of the social accountability and transparency.

Detail Results of the Meeting

Topics	Speakers/Presenters
Welcome and Opening Remarks	Ms. Michael Roberts IDE Country Director and CCC EXCOM Member Mr. Michael Roberts started with warmly welcomed to the participants and expressed his appreciation to members for the value time and always keep working together for poverty reduction and as well as always worked in solidarity to promote democracy space in Cambodia. Roberts had been working in Cambodia for over 25 years and currently serving as the Country Director of IDE. CCC is very important for CSOs in Cambodia as the organization has led on the advocacy of the implications of LANGO, coordinating CSOs in SDGs, promoting good governance of NGO and support

Topics	Speakers/Presenters
	<p>the D&D reform as well as working on the financing for development.</p> <p>Following by the agenda objectives and on behalf of the Executive Committee and CCC's Colleagues, he expressed his sincere thanks to members for attending the meeting and announced the officially opening the meeting.</p>
<p>Introduction to new members</p>	<p>Mr. Yieb Meta, Executive Director of CFT</p> <p>Community For Transformation is established in 2005 as Christian NGO and working toward community development in Kampong Speu province. There are four main projects running by CFT currently, integrated community development, improving social justice, enhance community education, organizational and institutional development.</p> <p>More details of CFT</p>
<p><u>Session 1: Update</u> - CCC digital platform (New Interface of NGO database, Online data collection tools, Social Media Guideline) - Member Satisfaction Survey Result</p> <p>Question and Answer</p>	<p>Ms. Sin Putheary, Head of Communications and Membership Development of CCC</p> <p><u>Member Satisfaction Survey 2015</u> CCC had conducted the survey with its 160 members on the service satisfactory. Among all member, only some members answered all the questions in questionnaire, while most did not answered all of the questions. Among 160 members of INGO and LNGO, only 51% of INGO responded to the questions and only 41% from LNGO. Most of the respondents are in the senior position or manager, which is 80%. Only 17% of the respondent is coming from director.</p> <p>There are few key highlights. CCC's member considered the factor to join CCC's service because of knowledge and information network is 85%. Another factor to join CCC is capacity building through learning forum and the provided services ranked second at 69%. The third factor is to strengthening the sector group, 66%.</p> <p>The survey also found that only 19% of the respondent said that there were exchange programs between the members. 28% between members and government, while member has only 25% of opportunity to meet with the key government officials. The chance of meeting between members and donors as well as DPs is only 39%.</p> <p><u>Social Media Guideline</u> CCC had also developed a Social Media Guideline that will serve as the benefits for all of the CSOs in Cambodia. The guideline focus mainly to the NGOs page administrator and it is particularly focus on facebook. The guideline will help the CSOs to better use the social media by defining objectives and goals. Download social media guideline</p>

Topics	Speakers/Presenters
	<p><u>Online data collection tool</u> CCC had also produced an app that could be used as a tool to collect data online. We had pilot the app with 4 NGOs and found that it is very useful. The App itself is working both offline and online, which will sync all of the data automatically to the server when the device is connected to the internet.</p> <p><u>Online NGOs Database</u> CCC had redesigned the User Interface of online database based on 5 main questions. The new User Interface is friendlier using and contains all necessary information. Each member will received an account detail, containing User Name and Password, through e-mail for login. Newly to this UI, each member could edit or make change the data of their own.</p> <p>More details on the slide presentation</p>
<p>Session 4: Launching the CBO project “Culturing good practice and sustainability of Community Based Organizations”</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Short presentation about the project, • Key remark from of Working Group for CBO Guidelines 	<p>Mr. Chhorn Vatanak, Component I Manager of CCC</p> <p>Based on the research paper from Cambodia Development Research Institute (CDRI), there are more than 20,000 Community Based Organizations (CBOs) in Cambodia with very diverse and does not have any specific formation.</p> <p>To responding to the diversity and no specific formation, CCC and ICSO working together to produce the CBO guideline with financial support from DFAT. This project running by the two main objectives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ❖ To have the Community Based Organizations (CBOs) in Cambodia well governed, capable and responsive to respective development challenges of their communities. ❖ To promote good governance, quality service and sustainability of the Community Based Organizations (CBOs) in Cambodia through the adoption of CBO Guidelines <p>This project has piloted in five provinces and one city such Battambang, Siem Reap, Kampong Chhnang, Takeo, Kratie and Phnom Penh from January 2016 to April 2017.</p> <p>More on slide presentation</p> <p>Mr. Sao Vansey, ICSO Executive Director and CBO Representative TWG</p> <p>As CSO, we want to see sustainability of CBO by having their own standard guideline. In our study, we found that usually INGO provide financial support to LNGO, then goes to CBO. The process of produce the guideline had required a lot of administrative work. Not much difference from NGOs, CBOs need a good governance and practical tool to survive. Even this pilot project has only one year term but it will produce with the good guideline tool for all</p>

Topics	Speakers/Presenters
	CBOs to implementation for sustainability of their project.
<p>Session 3: Taxation in civil society</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Rational of the taxation • Preliminary findings of quick survey on Taxation among CCC members • Recommendations and Suggestions from findings to members • Joint strategy & Action Points among CCC members on Taxation 	<p>Mr. Soeung Saroeun, Executive Director of CCC</p> <p>NGO and other institutional sectors have paid tax on salary to Royal Government of Cambodia. Some people hope to get the benefit after the paying tax on salary when they are on the retirement such as the government officials, but they do not have any clear instruction for implementation to the tax on salary that they paid to the government.</p> <p>Responding to the comment and concern from the member, CCC had conducted the quick survey on taxation especially tax on salary to Cambodian and expatriate staff, the main objective of the survey to:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> a) Understand the relationships between CCC members and government (including line ministries) and between members and their partners (NGOs and CBOs) and the level of compliance with the Taxation Law, b) Support development of strategies to address some consequences faced by CCC members and their partners. <p>The findings shown that only 68 members (49% LNGOs and 51% INGOs) responding to the survey and more than 90% of respondents are senior manager, the respondent not answered to all questions, 52% of all members support to the survey while 48% of member refused not to respond to the survey. Around 75% of respondent answer that they paid tax for national staff and 22% had paid tax for expatriate staff and 25% of respondent answer that they are not paid tax for national staff and 78% are not paid tax for expatriate staff.</p> <p>The survey also put off the recommendation and suggestion from respondent that:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ▪ CCC to facilitate the process of tax compliance; ▪ Tax Dep. should simplify the process for tax payers especially NGOs staff, and clear guideline for tax enforcement; ▪ Government should have retirement fund for NGOs staff; ▪ Government should encourage NGOs to pay tax, rather than putting punishment measurements; ▪ Should have wider discussion on request to government to exempt tax for NGOs. <p><u>Questions and Answers:</u></p> <p><i>Q. How expats pay the tax to Cambodian government? Does the expatriate staff need to pay tax for any type of visa (B, E, C)?</i></p> <p><i>A. Taxation is very sensitive issue. I believe that our EXCOM plays more important role in help to facilitate this discussion. We will have working group on taxation and task force for taking action. The meeting of the team and task force ToR will be ready after Khmer New Year.</i></p>

Topics	Speakers/Presenters
	<p>Q. Nyemo started working in Cambodia since 1997 until 2004. As the situation changed, Nyemo decided to close office in 2006. However, the tax department said that they will come to audit this NGO before could closed the project. As result, Nyemo need to pay tax to the government and Nyemo also hired a private auditing firm to consult on the period for keeping financial document for government audit; they suggest that we need to keep at least 10 years, so what should we do in this case?</p> <p>Suggestion:</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. <i>The action point to set up the working group on taxation as some expatriate staff had paid tax at their own countries but they still require to pay tax again in Cambodia so the working group need to be working on this and discuss with the government for exemption or not.</i> 2. <i>NGO in Cambodia has only start paying tax in the last 15 years or so. It has seen that CSOs in Cambodia does not have good partnership development with the government, therefore, taxation issue should be solved through professional advocacy strategy.</i>
<p>Session 5: - Global Standard for CSOs Accountability</p>	<p>Mr. Sorn Savoeun, NGO GPP Certification Officer of CCC</p> <p>There are around 434 codes of standard for CSOs around the world. 34 of them are in Asia region. Therefore, there was an idea to bring all of the code together, to produce a global standard for CSO accountability. In the working group, there are 9 project partners from key different regions, aimed to develop a guideline within 3 years, from 2015 to 2018, for a new globally acceptable standard code. The project is financially supporting by SIDA. The main objectives of the project are to improve accountability code and practices, reduce transaction costs use synergies and contribute to more enabling environment for CSOs. Among the 9 project partners, there are 1500 CSOs members.</p> <p>As the progress, there are several meetings were holding since 2014. The first meeting was in Berlin on August 2014, second one was in Paris on October 2014, third one in Phnom Penh on October 2015. The new global standard has 4 unique features. Common frame for entire CSO sector, Accountability approach is truly global, focus on global level and local adaptability and provide credible sector voice. As the project milestone, the first roll out of Global Standard and market it to create more enabling environment will be release in 2017.</p> <p>More on slide presentation</p>
<p>Conclusion and closing remark</p>	<p>Dr. El Sotheary, Head of Program of CCC</p> <p>In the closing remark, she expressed special thanks to the speakers, all participants for asking questions actively. She suggested to the participants to stay updated on other advocacy effort on the social media, CCC's email and other meetings.</p>

General Feedback of Participants:

In general, participants expressed their appreciation to the general organizing of the meeting, as attached table especially the content of the meeting was very interested by the participants with 77% of good and very good. The following table is the evaluation for the meeting managing.

	<i>Don't Know</i>	<i>Poor</i>	<i>Fair</i>	<i>Good</i>	<i>Very Good</i>
Overall rating of this meeting	--	3	35	56	6
Contents of the meeting	--	3	21	62	15
Organizing of the meeting	--	6	35	53	6
Facilitator/resource persons	--	3	29	59	9

General Comments

- *It is very important for all members especially what have discussed this morning on the taxation*
- *Very useful for sharing knowledge*

Next Bi-monthly members meeting

- *Taxation*
- *LANGO*
- *CBO guideline*
- *Global standard for CSOs*
- *TWG on taxation*
- *Situation about Human Rights in Cambodia and progress of Human Rights promotion*
- *Update on the Government accountability to CSOs compensation of salary tax*
- *Proposal writing*
- *Sustainable Development Goals (SDGs)*
- *Work permit for expatriate staff*

The next meeting is going to organized on 3 June 2016.